| **Student Name:** Vania Wong |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers the subscription model over the advertising model in social media |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 8 minutes’ long.]  Good use of the fact that users become the product as the hook for today.  On the set-up:   * Strategic middle ground of using the freemium model, we will need to clarify what EXTENT of services are available on the free-side. * Good clarity as well on subscription-based companies prioritising user rights, such as privacy, however this is not something we can fiat (it’s not a policy debate, it’s a prefers debate). We will still need to mechanise how so later on. * Well done on examples throughout. * I need a clear winning pathway on what are the most important things in the debate!   The caveats on providing access to NGOs and social movements should be in the set-up, rather than the argument!   * We can also highlight that the costs are not exorbitant to begin with, they can easily afford it and we can offer tiered levels of subscription.   On the first argument:   * We went straight to corporate accountability after the first harm of the algorithm, when we should be listing out all of the harmful corporate practices first. Then link it directly with the advertising model.   + Because it isn’t clear as to why a subscription-model social media won’t still use the kind of algorithm that would lead to higher user engagement. * The second mechanistic harm on violation of data breaches as well flowed directly into the impact to disenfranchised communities.   + It’s a good impact, but we need to mechanise and link this exclusively to advertising-based models first. * We need to spend more time to explain how subscription-based models will reverse this!   + Explain that advert-based models exploit consent via extensive legal lingo.   + Good analysis on why it’s easy for users to unsubscribe, and this leads to easy pressure on corporations to listen to user demand.     - Can we explain why they cannot do the same under an advert model? * The human costs of this exploitation is under-stated.   Well done on the response to the POI on the power of big tech against state regulations!  On the second argument:   * Good claim on improving innovation via subscription models. * But will there be an adequate revenue base via subscriptions vs via advertising? I agree the revenue stream could be stable, but that only applies to well-to-do platforms. What about SMEs? * The incentive analysis is well done, but the capacity analysis is missing. * The impact of this is also quite vague, ground what kind of innovations will elevate the quality of services of social media to all?   Good job offering POIs today!  8.11 - Good timing. | | | | | | |